Pentahelix collaborative analysis through stakeholder engagement in realizing sustainable environmentally based tourism village governance to support the achievements of the Village SDGs

Deby Febriyan Eprilianto[1*], *Suci* Megawati[1], *Yuyun Eka Kartika* Sari[2], *Bambang* Sigit Pramono[3], *Lisa Amelia* Sari[1], *Azzahroh* Rachmadhani[1] and *Eni* Febrianti[1]

[1]Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, State University of Surabaya, 60231, Surabaya, Indonesia
[2]Doctoral Program in Social and Behavioral Sciences, Asia E University Malaysia, 50000, Selangor, Malaysia.
[3]Department of Master of Communication Science, University of 17 Agustus 1945 Surabaya, 60118, Surabaya, Indonesia.

Abstract. SDGs are a combination of universal and sustainable goals, targets, and indicators that can be applied to measure the reality of development, at the global, national, regional, area, and even village levels. Village SDGs are an integrated effort, one of which is to realize networked villages and culturally responsive villages to accelerate the achievement of the SDGs. The importance of a collaborative approach in village development to reduce village disparities, one of which is in the development of tourist villages. This study will analyze the goals and targets of the 17th Village SDGs, namely Partnership for village development through the role of stakeholders with their involvement in the governance of environmentally-based sustainable tourist villages in Tlemang Village, Indonesia. The method used in this study is descriptive qualitative through direct observation, structured interviews, and documentation studies. The results of this study indicate that stakeholder involvement in the process of environmentally-based tourist village governance is carried out by the government, academics, mass media, communities, and the private sector, each of which has a role consisting of policymakers, coordinators, facilitators, implementers, and accelerators. The success of this collaboration has earned Tlemang Village the title of Intangible Cultural Heritage.

---

[*] Corresponding author: debyeprilianto@unesa.ac.id

1 Introduction

SDGs are an important agenda in supporting the achievement of a sustainable system. Up to the village government level, the concept of Village SDGs is known to lead to the concept of sustainable governance [1]. There are at least 18 indicators in the realization of village SDGs. One of them to support the realization of sustainable village development requires collaborative strengthening of stakeholders. Sustainable environmental governance with a collaborative emphasis is needed [2]. Especially when juxtaposed with the development of the concept of tourism villages, the environment has potential. Many agendas have been carried out to support the achievement of sustainable environmental governance, one of which is through the participation of all elements of actors involved [3].

Village tourism is a tourism product that is developed based on the potential of the village, both in the form of community, nature, and culture as an identity that has a tourist attraction. Because of the uniqueness and diversity of each village, the development of tourist villages can be used as a strategy to increase Indonesia's tourist attractions [4]. Apart from being a product diversification strategy, another characteristic that makes tourist villages important to implement is the aspect of cultural and environmental preservation. Until 2018, there were 1,734 tourist villages, most of which were located in Java-Bali and Sumatera [5]. On the other hand, the development of tourism villages currently focuses on the development of natural and artificial tourism villages. The local wisdom of the culture owned by each village has not been well touched. In fact, this wisdom is an asset that if developed and managed properly can become a potential profitable tourist village.

The urgency of this research is in the aspect of sustainability of tourism village management, one of which is problematic in the management of Nyanggring cultural tourism village in Lamongan Regency. The Nyanggring culture is owned by Tlemang Village, Lamongan Regency, which since 2021 has been awarded as an Intangible Cultural Heritage (WBTB). The acquisition of this award should be an asset that continues to be preserved. However, unfortunately, until now the management of the Nyanggring cultural tourism village has not run optimally. One of the obstacles faced is the implementation of Nyanggring culture is only a locality. Even the people of Lamongan Regency from other villages do not recognize the existence of Nyanggring culture. Various efforts have been made, one of which is with the support of the local government through the Lamongan Regency Tourism and Culture Office and other parties. Institutional strengthening in supporting the realization of sustainable environmental management is needed, especially the role of women should receive support from the government so that their institutions can be recognized [6].

This research aims to know, understand, and analyze the role of stakeholders in the management of sustainable cultural tourism villages through a pentahelix collaborative approach. The use of this approach aims to analyze five important actors needed in the management of tourist villages to support sustainability aspects, namely government actors, private actors, community actors, academic actors, and media actors [7]. Ansell and Gash argued that the collaborative approach is a new concept in the formulation and implementation of public policy, by involving stakeholders from the government, the community, and the private sector to jointly engage in a consensus decision-making process [8]. The involvement of stakeholders or actors requires a process including dialogue between actors, building trust between actors, commitment to the process, internal legitimacy, and joint commitment. One of the collaborative approaches is the pentahelix model which is according to [9]. The pentahelix model is a reference for developing synergy between agencies to achieve goals. The role of pentahelix collaboration has the aim of innovation and contributes to the socio-economic and environmental progress of the region. Furthermore, it is said that in creating orchestration and ensuring the quality of activities, facilities, services, creating experiences and the value of tourism benefits in order to provide benefits and

benefits to the community and the surrounding environment, it is necessary to drive the tourism system through optimizing the role of business (business), government (government), community (community), academic (academics), and media (media publications) or abbreviated as BGCAM [9].

The role of stakeholders in the management of this tourist village is relevant to the existing concept. Where tourism development is an effort to optimize the tourism potential contained in areas that have tourism potential. Furthermore, emphasizes the importance of this in relation to the benefits of economic development that can be obtained by a country or region [10]. In addition, in tourism development efforts, the basic things that must be examined are the aspects of tourism development. According to Inskeep, it is stated that the aspects in question are as follows: a) Tourism Attractions and Activities: refers to all natural or artificial attractions and activities, and various activities related to something in the tourist attraction. The goal is to attract tourists to come visit; b) Accommodation: refers to lodging around the tourism site; c) Other facilities such as travel agents, restaurants and cafes, banks and money changers, and so on; d) Other transportation service providers include accessibility of transportation in and development areas, internal systems connecting tourist sites and development areas, and transportation within the development area; e) Other infrastructure, such as water, electricity, and telecommunications; and f) Institutional elements that refer to planning programs, education and training of resources, strategic promotional activities, investment policies, local economic development control programs, and socio-culture [11].

Efforts to realize a sustainable environment-based tourism village, in practice, require conditions that must be met. So that it is not necessarily if a village wants to step into a tourist village, then do the development just like that. In his view, he revealed several conditions for the realization of a tourist village, namely as follows: a) Good accessibility; b) Having tourist objects that can be developed; c) Getting support from the community and village government; d) Guaranteed village security; and e) Availability of adequate accommodation and human resources. Based on the explanation above, it can be seen that the development of the concept of village tourism is not an easy thing [11]. The village community and the village government must work together in realizing the concept of a tourist village through several improvements in terms of infrastructure and the preparation of human resources with capacity. Furthermore, the development of tourism villages must be in favor of the goal of improving the quality of life of the community as a whole, not for a handful of people [12].

2 Methods

This type of research uses descriptive with a qualitative approach. Qualitative descriptive research has a focal point in conveying information and ideas based on facts with an in-depth and detailed study of both the behavior of individuals, groups, and their daily experiences and studying, explaining, or interpreting a case. This is reviewed from the facts in the field strengthened by previous research [13]. The focus of this research is to analyze stakeholders related to the role in the development of a sustainable environment and culture-based tourism village in Tlemang Village, Ngimbang District, Lamongan Regency. While focusing on the role of stakeholders with a pentahelix approach to the involvement of environmental and cultural tourism development. The process of collecting research data was carried out by focusing on discussions and literature sources including books, documents, and the results of previous studies that were trusted in their validity. Data processing and analysis techniques in this study used qualitative data analysis methods. This research uses a case study analysis strategy, in which the analysis carried out differs from one stage to another starting from data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing carried out continuously and continuously.

3 Result and Discussion

The development of environmental and cultural tourism villages in Tlemang Village certainly has an impetus in optimizing the management of the involvement of various stakeholders. Environmental and cultural tourism called Nyanggring is a traditional tradition inherited from the ancestors of Tlemang Village which is carried out around the tomb. The tradition was inherited from Ki Buyut Terik, Ki Buyut Terik was a religious figure who spread religious teachings to the people of Tlemang Village. Nyanggring cultural tradition is a cultural tradition held every 24-27 Jumadil Awal (Javanese calendar). It has a purpose as an expression of gratitude to Allah SWT who has provided sustenance and blessings through abundant harvests [6, 14].

The Nyanggring tradition in Tlemang Village is carried out for four days and three nights. During the four days, the events have different meanings. On the first day, the community cleans the springs that provide clean water, "kedhuk sendhang lanang sendhang wedok". On the second day, they clean the grave of Ki Buyut Terik, who is a historical figure of the Tlemang community. On the third day, they hold a Sandur performance, which features karawitan and puppetry depicting the struggle to spread Islam. Sanggring vegetable cooking is the last event and is considered the highlight of the event. The process of cooking sayur sanggring can only be done by men, which is a unique cultural tradition of Tlemang Village. It is believed that the taste of the sanggring vegetable will affect the community in the future, so it should not be tasted during the cooking process. Because it is considered a sacred vegetable, sayur sanggring should only be made by men, which means they should be made by people who do not experience difficulties or hardships, such as women [15].

Tlemang Village itself is included in a village that contributes cultural heritage in the form of Nyanggring culture which has been registered as an Intangible Cultural Heritage (WBTB) in 2021. But in fact, until now this culture seems to be buried and not known by many people. This is due to the lack of people who know about their own native culture and is exacerbated by the influx of foreign cultures that are increasingly favored by the public, especially young Indonesians, over local culture. Role is an action as a form of step in achieving the expected goal. With this involvement, there are several stakeholders according to the pentahelix approach who collaborate in the development of Nyanggring culture such as the government, academics, mass media, the community, and the private sector. Each stakeholder has a different role and task. Of course, as a step in striving for practice, the process of developing Nyanggring culture needs a common goal to increase existing potential. In this research, there are stakeholders who participate in developing Nyanggring culture, of course, filled with a diversity of strategic roles performed. The main focus of this research is stakeholders reviewed from the pentahelix approach with 5 dimensions, namely: 1) policy creator; 2) facilitator, 3) coordinator, 4) implementer, and 5) accelerator [14, 16]. Stakeholders with a pentahelix approach, namely government, academics, the community, mass media, and the private sector, this fifth will have a more one-dimensional role or even each stakeholder is different, so that the results of this discussion will later be reviewed comprehensively to obtain harmony with theory [17].

Nyanggring culture is now increasingly facing serious challenges, of course there are efforts made by local stakeholders, such as in the reach of the government including (Tourism and Culture Office, Village Community Empowerment Office, Village government), while in the academic environment, there are (UNISLA and UNESA). In the range of communities involved (Pokdarwis and also youth organizations), of course, the Mass Media also took part in supporting (Radio Channel Lamongan and well-known influencer Nunu Elcidi), as well as private stakeholders who supported the Nyanggring culture in Tlemang village in the form of local MSMEs. The roles of these stakeholders are comprehensively described in the following discussion:

3.1 Government sectors

Government in a broad sense can be interpreted as government in the legislative, judicial, and so on. Meanwhile, the government in a narrow sense can be interpreted as a position holder as the executor of executive power or more narrowly the government as the organizer of state administration [18]. In this study, it is known that the government sector consists of the Tourism and Culture Office (Disparbud), the Village Community Empowerment Office, and the Tlemang Village Government. The government has an important role in each indicator of Policy creator, facilitator, coordinator, implementor, and accelerator in the process of developing Nyanggring cultural tourism [19].

Policy creators are stakeholders who play a role and have the authority to make decisions and make policies. The government is an actor of the policy creator, which is carried out through the Tourism and Culture Office to make policies in the form of the NCE (Nyanggring Culture Education) program in collaboration with the Tlemang village government. The policy conceptualized by NCE is the development of local cultural potential and the environment by collaborating between various parties to support and succeed the concept designed by involving all elements to work together in order to achieve the desired goals. The implementation of NCE requires cooperation between the Tlemang Village Government and the Lamongan Regency Tourism and Culture Office in explaining through the agency's website. Apart from the Tourism and Culture Office, the Tlemang village government also has an important role including: 1) Making perdes related to Pokdarwis (Tourism Awareness Group); 2) Planning the Nyanggring cultural tradition performance; 3) Approving the cooperation between agencies that will come to the Nyanggring event.

The next role played by the government is as a facilitator [20]. The Lamongan Regency Tourism and Culture Office and the Village Community Empowerment Office are in charge of facilitating the planned training program and providing materials, becoming a bridge between CSR for event implementation, and as a companion and director of the pokdarwis and village government. Meanwhile, the Tlemang village government itself is tasked with providing facilities in the form of a place or space for program implementation.

Furthermore, Implementors are stakeholders who have a role in implementing programs and policies that will be implemented in a committed and sustainable manner. Almost all stakeholders in the analysis of the pentahelix approach have a role as policy implementors. The government has the task of implementing the policy program carefully in accordance with what has been formulated. Apart from the government and the community, it is also very important to act as actors and media to develop culture through NCE.

The government's role also includes being an accelerator [21, 22]. Accelerator is a role to accelerate and help contribute to a program that can run according to the target and even to accelerate its achievement [23]. In addition, the element that characterizes the accelerator is related to the funding structure [15]. Disparbud provides support for the implementation of the program and participates in the creation of supporting programs, the Village Community Empowerment Office provides support that is carried out in material and digital media, and the Tlemang Village Government plays a role in assisting the program funding process. It can be seen from previous research that the role of government is very complex. The NCE program is expected to help the development of Nyanggring cultural tourism village [24].

3.2 Academics sectors

In encouraging the development of tourist villages, academics are involved in strengthening insights and knowledge for tourism management [25]. Academics are part of scholars with 3 main roles, namely, the role of research, community service, and the role in community service [26]. Based on the research results of this study, the findings of the dimensions of the

role of academics are 3 including facilitators, coordinators, and also implementers [27]. This is in the role of facilitator as an academic who focuses on the field of education, of course, is involved in the development of the tourist village of Tlemang village, Ngimbang sub-district, Lamongan Regency in order to encourage to guide to create work in the creative industry through community service activities. Whereas in the role of coordinator and implementer as a forum for research, academics coordinate with pokdarwis to analyze together by pouring in the form of critical review ideas. This step forms a consideration for each stakeholder involved so that their involvement can increase creativity and run optimally. In addition to this, the roles found based on research from Lamongan University and Surabaya State University held community service and KKN as a manifestation of assisting in optimizing village potential with regular mentoring and monitoring. Mentoring and monitoring activities are one of important aspects to be able to find out a change before and after the program [28]. Continuous monitoring is one of the keys to the success of the program. Because when there are obstacles, the causes, and solutions can be controlled so that the program will always be structured according to what has been planned.

3.3 Mass media sectors

Mass media is one of the stakeholders that has an important role in helping to develop Nyanggring culture. This is because the mass media functions as a promotional medium and a link between the government and the wider community [26, 29]. So that the mass media can help in promoting Nyanggring culture by publicizing it through digital media so that it is better known by the people of Lamongan. In the research that has been conducted, the parties involved in the mass media include Radio Suara Lamongan and Influencers who act as implementors as well as accelerators.

The role of media as an implementor focuses on promotion and publication on social media. Social media plays an important role in the running of digital marketing and helps increase brand awareness [30]. For this reason, Radio Suara Lamongan (RSL) contributes greatly to the implementation as a radio under the auspices of the Lamongan government through channel 93.6 FM as stated on the Lamongan Regency website. In addition to the channel, RSL also has promotional media through You tube and Instagram platforms that can be accessed at any time. The impact of publications on social media can attract people to find out more about Nyanggring tourism village. Tourism objects that use social media as a means of promotion have experienced an increase in the number of visitors, social media that has advertising features can be a promotional tool such as Instagram, Tiktok, and YouTube [31].

Meanwhile, the next media role is an accelerator that functions as a media partner. Broadcast radio under the auspices of the government gets its budget and income entirely from the government. For this reason, RSL should be able to play an active role in various promotions, this role can be in the form of material assistance or becoming media support and media partners [32]. In a study entitled "Analysis of the Role of Regional Stakeholders in the Development of City Branding Lamongan Megilan" it has been explained that Radio Suara Lamongan often becomes a media partner for other stakeholders every time there is an event activity. The role of an influencer is also very necessary so that the publication of Nyanggring tourist village can be widely recognized not only by the people of Lamongan. One of the influencers who participated in the promotion of Nyanggring cultural tourism is Nunu Elcidi, who is an influencer and content creator from Lamongan. His creatively packaged promotions can attract people's interest and add to their attractiveness [15].

3.4 Community sectors

The community is one of the stakeholders of the analysis through the pentahelix approach that has a role no less important than other stakeholders, community-based development requires active community participation and involvement in the process of tourism development that will be and has been implemented [33]. Community participation in the development of tourism villages is very important to improve the quality and sustainability of tourism villages [34]. The community must be actively involved in the tourism development process as an organizer and beneficiary [35].

The role of the community as an implementer is the existence of Pokdarwis and youth organizations which are the main driving actors in the development of tourism concepts, tourism management, community empowerment, and the development of marketing strategies. Research related to this research was conducted by Maharani entitled "Mendhak Nyanggring Tradition in Tlemang Village, Ngimbang District, Lamongan Regency as a Symbol of Gratitude to God" explaining the multiculturalism values contained in the Mendhak Nyanggring ceremony tradition in Tlemang Village, Ngimbang District, Lamongan Regency such as the value of solidarity, cooperation, tolerance, and togetherness [36]. Which in the implementation process requires contributions from various communities in order to organize this ceremony.

In addition to playing a role in managing, maintaining, and developing Nyanggring's cultural heritage, there are several community roles that are seen in Nyanggring culture, namely as ritual actors, cultural developers, key informants, and participations in strategy development. Besides that according to other research from Frasawi, Community participation in the process of developing a tourist village will be realized as a real activity if three main factors support it, namely (1) awareness, (2) ability, and (3) opportunities for the community to participate [37]. In this case, community spirit and awareness are the main factors for community participation in activities that lead to the development and development of the village by utilizing the potential or resources available in the village [38].

3.5 Private sectors

The private sector in the development of Nyanggring cultural tourism is an external party that synergizes in pursuing cultural sustainability. The private sector is a non-governmental body that manages its own expenses and needs [33]. However, of course, the involvement of the private sector must have support from the government which provides and gives freedom of creativity to help preserve the Nyanggring culture. Of course, this is to attract private interest to collaborate in developing and promoting this tourist attraction in a sustainable manner [21, 39].

Based on this research, the private parties involved in developing Nyanggring culture are local MSMEs. Apart from MSMEs, the private sector itself can come from companies that wish to collaborate in developing the Nyanggring cultural tourism village. In the findings of this research, based on 5 dimensions of stakeholder roles, the private sector plays a role in the role of implementer and accelerator [40]. The role of the private sector here is as a marketing supporting stakeholder in addition to promotion through mass media and providing financial support in efforts to implement the Nyanggring cultural tourism village development program. Marketing is one of the most important things in a product sales strategy. With a good marketing strategy, you can increase sales and introduce products to the wider community [18, 40]. In this case, the private sector and businesses that focus on developing cultural tourism products, both culinary and handicraft products, can collaborate with the mass media sector. to promote the product to the wider community. Apart from that,

collaboration with companies and business people can improve the products produced. This collaboration can be carried out between large companies and small business agents [41].

The aim of collaboration between the private sector and cultural tourism village managers is profit sharing [18]. This will be very mutually beneficial for the private sector and the tourism village development program itself. It is hoped that this will have a big impact on the development of cultural tourism products in the private sector. This is supported by research results [15] that MSMEs are the biggest target because they are able to open business opportunities and improve the community's economy. Of course, the role of being an MSME provides reinforcement for good cooperation with parties who support the development of the Nyanggring culture.

4 Conclusion

The realization of culture and environment-based tourism village management in Tlemang Village, Ngimbang District, Lamongan Regency is carried out through a pentahelix collaborative approach. This collaboration involves stakeholders to support the realization of sustainable environmental governance while supporting the achievement of village SDGs. The parties involved include government, academics, society, media, and the private sector. The role of the Government is to make policies and decisions related to tourism village development programs. Academics play a role in providing materials, monitoring, and mentoring during the implementation process of tourism village development programs through KKN and Community Service activities. Meanwhile, the community plays a role as the main driver in developing tourist villages with the formation of Pokdarwis. Then, the Mass Media participates in the promotion and dissemination of information about Nyanggring culture through radio broadcasts and social media, and the Private sector plays a role in marketing activities for products from cultural tourism villages in the form of craft and culinary products, as well as assisting with funding support. The involvement of these actors has supported the realization of sustainable cultural and environmentally-based tourism village governance in Tlemang Village. Suggestions that can be given from the results of this research include strengthening institutions in collaboration, because the distance of Tlemang Village from the city center requires technical collaboration that is more flexible and takes place easily and quickly from every actor involved, both from the government, academics, community, media and private. In fact, this collaboration, it can accelerate the realization of SDGs point 17, namely Partnership for Village Development, so that sustainable environmental-based cultural tourism village governance can be realized in Tlemang Village.

References

1. S. Bose, H. Z. Khan, Journal of Cleaner Productio **335** (2022)
2. M. R. Kurniawan, R. A. Artisa, Inovasi Pembangunan Jurnal Kelitbangan **11**, 1 (2023)
3. D. F. Eprilianto, M. F. Ma'ruf, G. W. Pradana, A. N. Hilmi, U. N. Habibah, *IOP Conf. Series : Earth and Environmental Science*, in Proceedings of the third International Symposium of Earth, Energy, Environmental Science, and Sustainable Development, 27-28 August 2022, Jakarta, Indonesia (2022)
4. D. S. Cahyaningsih, T. Suhartono, S. Widayati, Abdimas: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Universitas Merdeka Malang **6**, 1 (2021)

5. F. Ayuningsih, H. Pridia, S. Teviningrum, Pengembangan Wisata Perdesaan & Wisata Perkotaan: Rancangan Pola Perjalanan Gelang Projo (Magelang, Kulon Progo, Purworejo) (Kementerian Pariwisata, Jakarta, 2019)

6. D. F. Epriliinto, G. W. Pradana, S. Megawati, E. Febriyanti, D. R. Shobirin, R. H. Sajida, Community Development Journal: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat **4**, 3 (2023)

7. H. Ariwibowo, A. Wirapraja, Y. D. Putra, Jurnal Mebis (Manajemen Dan Bisnis) **3**, 1 (2018)

8. C. Ansel, A. Gash, Journal of Public Administration Research And Theory **18**, 4 (2008)

9. A. Amrial, E. Muhammad, A. M. Adrian, Social and Human Sciences **14**, 1 (2017)

10. O. A. Yoeti, Perencanaan Dan Pengembangan Pariwisata (PT Balai Pustaka Persero, Jakarta 2016).

11. H. S. Sakti, Perencanaan Pariwisata Perdesaan Berbasis Masyarakat (Graha Ilmu, Yogyakarta 2012)

12. R. F. Osin, N. K. Purwaningsih, I. W. A. Anggayan, International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding **8**, 1 (2021)

13. F. Widiyani, R. Ninik, S. Lestari, A. A. Gde, S. Utama, H. Umi, A. Albert, L. Sentosa, S. Siti, H. Dini, I. Kadek, A. A. Nurul, H. Muhammad, I. Fasa, Metode Penelitian Kualitatif (Zahir Publisihing, Sleman 2021)

14. D. F. Epriliinto, Y. E. K. Sari, M. F. Ma'ruf, G. W. Pradana, A. N. Lasmijan, E. Febriyanti, IOP Conf. Series : Earth and Environmental Science, in Proceedings of the third International Symposium of Earth, Energy, Environmental Science, and Sustainable Development, 27-28 August 2023, Jakarta, Indonesia (2023)

15. E. Febrianti, D. F. Epriliinto, M. F. Ma'ruf, G. W. Pradana, Jurnal Mediasosian: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Administrasi Negara **7**, 1 (2023)

16. E. Febrianti, D. F. Epriliinto, Publika **1849**, 18 (2023)

17. I. Edward, Tourism Planning and Sustainable Development Approach (Van Nostrand Reinblod, New York 1991)

18. R. Agustina, M. S. Soeaidy, H. Ribawanto Jurnal Administrasi Publik **2**, 844 (2014)

19. C. Liu, X. Dou, J. Li, L. A. Cai, Journal of Rural Studies **79** (2020)

20. A. F. Huda, I. D. Nurhaeni, D. G. Suharto, International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding **402**, 410 (2020)

21. F. Susanto, S. Indarti, Journal of Public Policy And Administration Silampari **5**, 1 (2023)

22. R. Rastegar, Tourism Research **85**, 102884 (2020)

23. B. McKercher, Tourism Management, **90**, 104475 (2022)

24. Y. Puspitasari, H. Haryono, E. Febrianti, Community Development Journal: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat **3**, 1 (2021)

25. S. Schweinsberg, R. Sharpley, S. Darcy, Tourism Management **91**, 104502 (2022)

26. E. E. Maturbongs, R. L. Lekatomperssy, Transparansi: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi **3**, 1 (2020)

27. F. Ali, B. Yasar, U. Khan, L. Ali, K. Ryu, Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport & Tourism Education **34**, 100478 (2024)

28. H. Haryono, E. Febrianti, D. F. Epriliinto, Community Development Journal **4**, 2 (2023)

29. Y. Liu, Y. Hou, J. Guo, C. Yan, Technological Forecasting and Social Change **206**, 123492 (2024)

30. C. O. Charli, Jurnal Ekobistek **40**, 48 (2020)

31. I. C. Rachman, Y. Indah, R. Raihan, Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Ekonomi Dan Bisnis Islam **4**, 2 (2023)

32. B. Dirdjo, S. Sumaryoto, Herodotus: Jurnal Pendidikan IPS 7, 1 (2024)

33. V. Rodrigues, Z. Breda, C. Rodrigues, Heliyon Journal **10**, 11 (2024)

34. R. Carvadlo, P. Reis, Reference Module in Social Science **1**, 1 (2024)

35. T. B. Vongvisitsin, W. Huang, B. King, Annals of Tourism Research **106**, 103759 (2024)

36. M. G. W. Maharani, Jurnal Adat Dan Budaya Indonesia **4**, 1 (2022)

37. E. S. Frasawi, Jurnal Pendidikan Geografi Undiksha **6**, 3 (2018)

38. O. Gocer, D. Bayacioglu, E.E. Karahan, P. Shrestha, Journal of Rural Studies **107**, 103238 (2024)

39. L. Plzakova, Evaluation and Program Planning **94**, 102151 (2022)

40. Y. K. P. Wan, X. Li, V.M. Lau, L. Dioko, Journal of Hospitality and Toursm Management **51**, 218 (2022)

41. C. Wang, H. Xu, Tourism Management **45**, 95 (2014)