

**IMPACT OF TRANSNATIONAL CRIMES ON
VULNERABILITIES OF PAKISTAN'S IMAGE**

FAHAD HAMEED KHAN

ASIA e UNIVERSITY

2024

IMPACT OF TRANSNATIONAL CRIMES ON VULNERABILITIES OF
PAKISTAN'S IMAGE

FAHAD HAMEED KHAN

A Thesis Submitted to Asia e University in
Fulfilment of the Requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

March 2024

ABSTRACT

For several decades, academic discussions have raged over how to properly define the term "Transnational Organized Crime." As far back as the 1970s, Reuter and Rubinstein warned that identifying Transnational Organized Crime (TOC) will always be the achilles' heel of investigations looking into criminal cross-border conduct. In recent years, numerous new laws have been enacted to affirm drug and human trafficking, money laundering, insider trading, and corruption all unlawful. Since it encompasses so many activities, different actors, agent provocateurs and more than one country; transnational organized crime is a difficult subject to handle. TOC generates between \$1.6 to \$2.2 trillion per year and thus considered as a danger to international security due to its "explosive and destabilizing repercussions" potential. TOC poses a significant threat to both direct and indirect peace, as well as cultural peace. It jeopardizes human rights, world peace, and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG). The industry of transnational organized crime is one that is always adapting to new markets and developing new types of criminal activity. It is an illicit enterprise that cuts across all boundaries; cultural, social, linguistic, and geographic. This corporation does not recognize any borders or standards because it operates outside of them. Apropos to the premise that TOC is more destructive than conventional and traditional crimes, it is added that each country has its own dynamics, causes and vulnerabilities to deal with Transnational Organized Crimes. Similarly, Pakistan faces special challenges in determining their causes, devising effective preventive tactics and instituting appropriate adjudication procedure. This investigation examines three types of TOC in Pakistan: *traditional*; which primarily involves illegal commodity (drug) trafficking and racketeering, *economic*; which includes money laundering and *social*; which includes human trafficking. Academics and researchers are unable to convey knowledge about TOC because it is covert and hidden, and because it is related to elites. As globalization have grown in popularity, TOC has proliferated in Pakistan. This means that even "domestic" gangs are becoming more involved in cross-border crimes and that all of the main criminal organizations now work and are organized on a global basis. This is serious threat to Pakistan's economy, its image and reputation in globalized world. The goal of this research is to fill in the gaps that have been detected in the existing knowledge. People will better understand why the rates of international crime in developed countries and Pakistan are so drastically different as a direct result of this study's findings.

Keywords: Transnational organized crime, Pakistan, drug trafficking, money laundering, human trafficking, challenges, effective preventive tactics.

APPROVAL

This is to certify that this thesis conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in quality and scope, for the fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The student has been supervised by: **Associate Professor Dr Oo Yu Hock**

The thesis has been examined and endorsed by:

Prof Dato Dr Sayed Mushtaq Hussain

Asia e University

Examiner 1

Prof Dr Jawahitha Sarabdeen,

Prince Sultan University,

Saudi Arabia

Examiner 2

This thesis was submitted to Asia e University and is accepted as fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.



Professor Dr Juhary Ali

Chairman, Examination Committee

Asia e University

20th March 2024

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis submitted in fulfilment of the PhD degree is my own work and that all contributions from any other persons or sources are properly and duly cited. I further declare that the material has not been submitted either in whole or in part, for a degree at this or any other university. In making this declaration, I understand and acknowledge any breaches in this declaration constitute academic misconduct, which may result in my expulsion from the programme and/or exclusion from the award of the degree.

Name: Fahad Hameed Khan

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Fahad Hameed Khan', written in a cursive style.

Signature of Candidate:

Date: 20 March 2024

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Innumerable thanks to Allah for the gift of wisdom and knowledge and for giving me the courage for accomplishment of the thesis.

I take this opportunity to express my profound gratitude to *Associate Professor Dr Oo Yu Hock* for his erudite guidance, generous and friendly nature, constant encouragement, critical evaluation, continuous guidance and counsel during the whole course of this work. His diligence and deep understanding of the subject were really a source of inspiration. I must acknowledge that I have been profited immensely by working under a distinguished thinker like him.

I also like to thank esteemed *Asia e University Malaysia* and *OM International Pakistan* for providing me all the support and encouragement.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my father, *Abdul Hameed Khan*, whose unwavering support, encouragement and guidance have been a constant source of inspiration throughout the entirety of my journey. His tireless work ethics and dedication to excellence instilled in me the same values, which have driven me to pursue my PhD degree. His believe in my abilities and determination to succeed played a crucial role in my accomplishments. Although he is no longer with us, his memory and influence continue to inspire me everyday. *I dedicate this thesis to him, with love and appreciation.*

Finally, I thank my wife for her moral support throughout the research work.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
APPROVAL	iii
DECLARATION	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiii
LIST OF ABBREVIATION	xv
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.0 Background of the Study	1
1.1 Overview	1
1.1.1 General	1
1.1.2 Drug Trafficking	4
1.1.3 Money Laundering	4
1.1.4 Human Trafficking	5
1.2 Background	5
1.2.1 General	5
1.2.2 Drugs Trafficking	11
1.2.3 Human Trafficking	13
1.2.4 Human and Organ Trafficking	17
1.2.5 Money Laundering	22
1.3 Research Gap	24
1.4 Research Problem	25
1.5 Research Questions	27
1.6 Objectives of the Study	27
1.7 Justification and Rationale	27
1.8 Significance of the Study	28
1.9 Research Methodology	28
1.10 Definition of Key Terms	29
1.10.1 Crime	29
1.10.2 Transnational Organized Crime	29
1.10.3 Drug Trafficking	30
1.10.4 Money Laundering	31
1.10.5 Human Trafficking	31
1.11 Structure of the Thesis	32
1.12 Schedule of Study (Gantt Chart)	33
CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF LITERATURE	34
2.0 Introduction	34
2.1 Crimes	34
2.1.1 Transnational Organized Crime	35
2.1.2 Multiple Forms of Transnational Organized Crime	39
2.2 Drug Trafficking	40
2.2.1 Drug Patterns	40
2.2.2 Production	42
2.2.3 Drug Distribution Groups	42

2.2.4	Drug Users	45
2.2.5	Impacts	46
2.2.6	Impact on Economy	49
2.3	Money Laundering	52
2.3.1	International Developments	54
2.3.2	Objectives	56
2.3.3	Stages	57
2.3.4	Impact on Economy	58
2.3.5	Impact on Society	62
2.4	Human Trafficking	63
2.4.1	Types of Trafficking	65
2.4.2	The Distinctions Between Smuggling and Trafficking	66
2.4.3	Trafficking as Modern-Day Slavery	69
2.4.4	Global Perspective	71
2.4.5	Impacts	73
2.4.6	The Economic Consequences of Human Trafficking	76
2.4.7	Human Trafficking on a Certain Scale	83
2.5	TOC and State	84
2.6	Organized Crime and Human Security	87
2.7	Sustainable Security	90
2.8	Organized Crime and Human Rights	92
2.8.1	Victimization of Helpless Segment of Society	93
2.8.2	Modern Day Slavery	94
2.8.3	Threat to Democracies	94
2.8.4	Economic Insecurities	95
2.8.5	Promote Racism	96
2.8.6	Violence and Retaliation	96
2.9	Political Impact of Transnational Organized Crime	97
2.9.1	Challenge to Sovereignty	98
2.9.2	Generation of Alternate Loyalties	99
2.9.3	Manipulating Electoral Process	99
2.9.4	Political Culture	100
2.9.5	Influence on Government Institutions	101
2.9.6	Establishment of Parallel Justice System	102
2.9.7	Influence on Political Institutions	105
2.9.8	Irrational Public Policy	106
2.10	Way Forward	107

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY 108

3.0	General	108
3.1	Research Philosophy	108
3.2	Research Approach	109
3.3	Research Methods	110
3.4	Nature of Research	113
3.4.1	Research Strategy	113
3.4.2	Time Horizon	114
3.5	Population and Sampling	115
3.5.1	Population	115
3.5.2	Sampling	115
3.5.3	Sampling Unit	116

3.5.4	Sampling Technique	116
3.6	Data Collection and Procedure	117
3.7	Data Validity and Reliability	118
3.7.1	Reliability	118
3.7.2	Validity	119
CHAPTER 4 RESULTS AND ANALYSIS		120
4.0	General	120
4.1	Impact Assessment of Drug Trafficking	120
4.2	Drug Trafficking in Pakistan: Vulnerabilities and Counter Measures	127
4.2.1	Background	127
4.2.2	Overview of Pakistan's Drug Problem	128
4.2.3	Transit Route Problem	131
4.2.4	Domestic Drug Use Problem	133
4.2.5	Drug Use in Pakistan	138
4.2.6	National Drug Use Estimates of Pakistan	140
4.2.7	National Drug Use Estimates, by Drug Type in Pakistan	141
4.2.8	Trends in Drug Use Prevalence & Patterns Over Time	147
4.2.9	Drug Use Among Women in Pakistan	148
4.2.10	Employment Status Among Drug Users in Pakistan	149
4.2.11	Drug Use and Age in Pakistan	150
4.2.12	Case Study	150
4.2.13	Reasons for Initiating and Continuing Drug Use	151
4.2.14	Law Enforcement Structures and Challenges	152
4.2.15	LEAs Responsible for Drug Interdiction:	154
4.2.16	Vulnerabilities and Challenges for Pakistan	154
4.2.17	Strategic Approach to Deal with Pakistan's Drug Problem	157
4.3	The Impact of Money Laundering	161
4.3.1	Macroeconomics	161
4.3.2	Money Laundering and Pakistan	168
4.3.3	Terrorism Financing	172
4.3.4	Pakistan & International AML Standards & Organizations	173
4.3.5	Prominent Cases of Money Laundering in Pakistan	174
4.3.6	Financial Sector of Pakistan	175
4.3.7	Regulatory Bodies of Financial Institutions in Pakistan.	175
4.3.8	Supervisory arrangements – FIs and DNFBPs of Pakistan	177
4.3.9	Currency Transaction Reporting (CTR)	179
4.3.10	Suspicion Transaction Reporting (STR)	179
4.3.11	Consistency of STR reporting in Pakistan's ML/TF Risks	183
4.3.12	Analysis of the Data	186
4.3.13	Identification/ Investigation of ML Cases & Vulnerabilitie	187
4.3.14	FIA Enforcement Action Against Hawala/Hundi	189
4.3.15	Remedial Actions & Effective, Proportionate & Sanctions	190
4.3.16	Pakistan Rating Assigned by Asia/ Pacific Group on ML	193
4.3.17	Conclusion	196
4.4	The Impact of Human Trafficking	198
4.4.1	Human Trafficking in Pakistan	204
4.4.2	Pakistan's Human Smuggling Problem	205
4.4.3	Factors and Dynamics of Human Smuggling	208
4.4.4	Vulnerable Groups	210

4.4.5	Pakistan as a Transit of Human Smuggling	210
4.4.6	Human Trafficking in Pakistan	211
4.4.7	Trafficking Women and Children for Sexual Exploitation	212
4.4.8	Bonded Labour	212
4.4.9	Pakistan's Legal Framework for Human Trafficking	213
4.4.10	Policy Recommendations	215
4.5	Ethical Consideration	218
4.6	Summary	219
CHAPTER 5 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION		220
5.0	Discussion	220
5.1	TOC and State Capacity	225
5.1.1	Multilateral Crime Control Capacity	227
5.1.2	International Response Capacity	229
5.1.3	Building State and Society Capacity of Pakistan	230
5.2	Theoretical and Policy Implications	231
5.3	Policy Recommendations	234
5.4	Problems of Research on Transnational Organized Crime	238
5.5	Recommendations for Future Research	239
5.6	Limitations of the Study	241
5.7	Conclusions	242
REFERENCES		246
APPENDICES		267
	Appendix A.	267
	Appendix B.	271
	Appendix C.	288

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1.1 Gantt chart	33
2.1 Global estimates of the use of various drugs	44
4.1 Annual prevalence	140
4.2 National drug use estimates by drug type in Pakistan	141
4.3 Investment in drug problem vis-à-vis cost of drug problem	156
4.4 SBP regulated institutions	176
4.5 SECP regulated institutions	177
4.6 Supervisory arrangements - FIs	177
4.7 Supervisory arrangements - DNFBPs	178
4.8 STRs filed with FMU	179
4.9 CTRs filed with FMU	180
4.10 STRs received and analyzed	182
4.11 Percentage of total STRs analyzed and disseminated as FIs by crime type	183
4.12 Money laundering in Pakistan (data available from 2013-2018)	185
4.13 Statistics of major predicate crimes (data available till August 2022)	185
4.14 FIA enforcement	190
4.15 Monetary penalties imposed on banks for AML/ CFT violations by SBP	190
4.16 Comparison between the monetary penalties and total bank assets	191
4.17 SBP enforcement action - exchange companies	192
4.18 SBP monetary sanctions on MFBs for AML/CFTs violations	193
4.19 National rating assigned by NRA	193
4.20 National rating assigned in the NRA to sectors	193
4.21 Effective rating	194

4.22	Technical compliance rating	195
4.23	Human trafficking victims	199
4.24	Labour force participation rates in Pakistan (2014-2022)	204
4.25	Legal regime of law enforcement on human smuggling and trafficking	215

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
2.1 Global drug output index	43
2.2 Global trend in the estimated number of drug users	46
2.3 Percentage of people in treatment by primary drug type & region	52
2.4 Human trafficking victims by age, sex and region	66
2.5 Human trafficking victims by form of exploitation	71
2.6 Human trafficking victims by age, sex and region	73
4.1 Population growth and drug use	121
4.2 Number of people who used drugs in 2018	122
4.3 Drug use trend in different economies	122
4.4 Profit sharing among different actors of drug trafficking	123
4.5 GDP generation (%) through (alleged) drug money	125
4.6 Side effects of drug trafficking	126
4.7 Poppy cultivation in Pakistan	128
4.8 Pakistan and neighboring countries	130
4.9 Afghanistan opium cultivation	132
4.10 Drug trafficking in Pakistan	133
4.11 Opium cultivation in Afghanistan	135
4.12 Opiate trafficking route of Pakistan	136
4.13 Annual prevalence of all illicit drug use in Pakistan	140
4.14 Annual prevalence of illicit drug use in Pakistan	141
4.15 Annual prevalence of cannabis use in Pakistan	143
4.16 Annual prevalence use of opiate use in Pakistan	143
4.17 Annual prevalence use of ATS use in Pakistan	145

4.18	Annual prevalence prescription opioid (painkiller) misuse in Pakistan	147
4.19	Annual prevalence of tranquiliser or sedative misuse in Pakistan	147
4.20	Annual prevalence of regular opiate and injected drugs use (2010-2022)	148
4.21	Drug use among women in Pakistan: low prevalence or hidden population	149
4.22	Employment status among regular opiate users and non users (male)	149
4.23	Prevalence of drug use within age groups	150
4.24	Percentage of reasons for drug use among dependant opiate users	152
4.25	Reason for continued drug use after initiation (percentage)	152
4.26	Opiate seized in Pakistan	153
4.27	Black money investment	162
4.28	Performance of banks	163
4.29	Impact on economic growth	164
4.30	Corruption	165
4.31	Portion in corruption	166
4.32	Number of human trafficking victims (million)	199
4.33	Vehemently sexual exploitation	200
4.34	Forced exploitation in different economies	200
4.35	Quantity of human trafficking victims	201
4.36	Economy and human trafficking	203
4.37	International human smuggling routes	207

LIST OF ABBREVIATION

ADHD	Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder
AML	Anti-money Laundering
AMLA	Anti-money Laundering Act
ANF	Anti-Narcotics Force
APGMJA	All Pakistan Gem Merchant and Jewelers Association
ATA	Anti-Terrorism Act
ATS	Amphetamine Type Stimulants
BAU	Behavioral Analysis Unit
BJS	Bureau of Justice Statistics
CAC	Convention Against Corruption
CDNS	Central Directorate of National Savings
CFT	Counter Terror Financing
CIFP	Country Indicator for Foreign Policy
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CNSA	Control of Narcotics Substances Act
CPI	Consumer Price Index
CrPC	Criminal Procedure
CSIS	Center for Strategy and International Studies

CTOC	Convention against Transnational Organized Crime
CTR	Currency Transaction Report /Reporting
DFI	Development Financial Institutions
DNFBP	Designated Non-Financial Business and Professionals
DOI	Declaration of Istanbul
DoJ	Department of Justice
DoS	Denial of Service
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EC	Exchange Company
ECAP	Exchange Companies Association of Pakistan
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (Revolutionary Armed Force of Colombia)
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
FBR	Federal Board of Revenue
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FERA	Foreign Exchange Regulation Act
FIA	Federal Investigation Agency

FinCEN	Financial Crimes Enforcement Network
FIs	Financial Institutions
FIU	Financial Intelligence Unit
FMU	Financial Monitoring Unit
FORP	Federation of Realtors of Pakistan
FY	Fiscal Year
G8 summit	Group of 8 countries
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GDP	Gross Domestic Products
GDPG	Gross Domestic Products Growth
GFI	Global Financial Integrity
GIFT	Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking
GSI	The General Stability Index
H5N1	Hemagglutinin type 5 and Neuraminidase type 1
HDI	Human Development Index
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IATF	Inter-Agency Task Force
ICAP	Institute of Chartered Accountants of Pakistan
ICT	Islamabad Capital Territory

ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
Interpol	International Criminal Police Organization
IP	Intellectual Property
IPE	International Political Economy / Inter Professional Education
IR	Inland Revenue
IW	Information Warfare
IWT	Illegal Wildlife Trade
JIT	Joint Investigation Team
LEAs	Law Enforcement Agencies
LHLRA	Lawyer for Human Rights and Legal Aid
MARA	Most At Risk Adolescents
MENA	Middle east / North Africa
MFB	Micro Finance Bank
ML	Money laundering
MLA	Mutual Legal Assistance
MNC	Multinational Corporations
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MRTC	Model Addiction Treatment and Rehabilitation Center

MVTS	Money or Value Transfer Service
NAB	National Accountability Bureau
NBFI	Non-Bank Financial Institution
NCVS	National Crime Victimization Survey (NCVS)
NDCP	National Drug Control Program
NDIC	Nigeria Deposit Insurance Corporation
NFTs	Non-Fungible Tokens
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NIC	Narcotics Interdiction Committee
NIOC	National Initiative against Organized Crime
NRA	National Risk Assessment
OC	Organized Criminal
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OFC	Offshore Financial Centre
OGM	Organismes Genetiement Modifies
OHCHR	Office of High Commissioner for Human Rights
PBC	Pakistan Bar Council
PDA	Personal Digital Assistants
PKR	Pakistani Rupees

POM	Prescription Only Medicines
PRB	Policy Review Board
PSDP	Public Sector Development Program
PTC	Police Training Center
PTSD	Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder
RTF	Regional Task Force
SAR	Suspicious Activity Report
SARS	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome
SBP	State Bank of Pakistan
SCP	Situational Crime Prevention
SCU	Special Coordination Unit
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SDPI	Sustainable Development Policy Institution
SECP	Security and Exchange Commission of Pakistan
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
SRO	Statutory Regulatory Order
STR	Suspicious Transaction Report
TB	Tuberculosis
TCC	Transnational Capitalist Class

TF	Terror Financing
THC	Tetrahydrocannabinol
TIPS	Transjugular Intrahepatic Portosystemic Shunt
TNCs	Transnational Corporations
TOC	Transnational Organization Crime
TOCL	Transnational Organization for Child Labor
TOR	The Onion Routing
TRAFFIC	Trade Record Analysis of Flora and Fauna In Commerce
TVPA	Trafficking Victims Protection Act
UFO	Unidentified Flying Object
UN	United Nations
UNAIDS	United Nations Program for AIDS
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Program
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
UNTOC	United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime

US	United States
USAID	U.S. Agency for International Development
USD	United States Dollar
VHA	Voluntary Health Association
WHO	World Health Organization
WWF	World Wildlife Fund
ZARA	Zainab Alert Response and Recovery Agency

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Background of the Study

This section deliberates the existence and value of transnational crime on the economy of the country and the problem due to which this study has been conducted. This chapter also discusses justification of the study and provides a rationale for choosing a particular variable followed by significance of the study. Moreover, this chapter highlights objectives of study and research questions that address the particular issue and describes the layout of the thesis.

1.1 Overview

1.1.1 General

Transnational organized crime can be used to describe any major international crime with a financial goal that takes place in more than one country. Transnational organized crime includes illicit activities like the trade in drugs, migrants, people, weapons, and counterfeit goods (Natarajan, 2019). It also includes unlawful trade in wildlife, cultural property, and even some types of cybercrime. Transnational organized crime is a thriving part of the global economy. This is because demand changes and criminals come up with new ways to make money. According to estimates, the global revenue generated by transnational crimes was anywhere from \$1.6 trillion to \$2.2 trillion in 2014. In 2014, this figure was equivalent to approximately 2.5 percent of the total GDP of the world (Statista, 2018). Huge amounts of black money can impair legal economies and make it hard to run a country. For example, corruption and buying elections, drug, arms and human